BY ORDER OF THE COMMANDER EDWARDS AIR FORCE BASE



EDWARDS AIR FORCE BASE INSTRUCTION 36-2502

15 APRIL 2015 Certified Current 18 July 2017

Personnel
SENIOR AIRMAN BELOW-THEZONE PROMOTION PROGRAM

COMPLIANCE WITH THIS PUBLICATION IS MANDATORY

ACCESSIBILITY: Publications and forms are available on the e-Publishing website at

www.e-Publishing.af.mil for downloading or ordering

RELEASABILITY: There are no releasability restrictions on this publication

OPR: 412 FSS/FSMPD Certified by: 412 MSG

(Colonel Eric L. Leshinsky)

Pages: 15

This instruction implements Air Force Policy Directive (AFPD) 36-25, Military Promotion and Demotion, and Air Force Instruction (AFI) 36-2502, Airman Promotion/Demotion Programs, to establish procedures policies, responsibilities and management of the Senior Airman Below-the-Zone (BTZ) Promotion Program on Edwards Air Force Base. Both the Central Base Board (CBB) and large unit selection boards will utilize the procedures outlined in this instruction. Request for waivers must be processed through command channels to the publication OPR for consideration. See Attachment 1 for a glossary of references and supporting information. Ensure that all records created as a result of processes prescribed in this publication are maintained IAW Air Force Manual (AFMAN) 33-363, Management of Records, and disposed of IAW Air Force Records Information Management System (AFRIMS) Records Disposition Schedule (RDS). Refer recommended changes and questions about this publication to the Office of Primary Responsibility (OPR) using the AF Form 847, Recommendation for Change of Publication; route AF Form 847s from the field through the appropriate functional's chain of command. This document attachments contain FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY (FOUO) which must be protected under the Freedom of Information Act (5 U.S.C. 552) and/or the Privacy Act of 1974 (5 U.S.C. 552a). Unauthorized disclosure or misuse of this personal information may result in disciplinary action, criminal and/or civil penalties.

1. Objective.

1.1. The SrA BTZ Program provides a one-time consideration for early promotion to exceptionally well-qualified Airmen First Class. Selection opportunity is based on 15 percent of eligibles for promotion effective 6 months prior to the fixed (fully qualified) phase point.

- 1.2. Only the very best performers should be nominated for BTZ. They must be positive role models for others and clearly deserve early promotion. The unit commander will ensure that the nominee meets fitness standards and exemplifies the standards for appearance and conduct. Commanders and First Sergeants will screen for negative quality force indicators. If the pool of eligibles doesn't include Airmen of this caliber, the full BTZ quota will not be used by the convening authority.
- 1.3. Timelines: A1Cs are eligible for BTZ consideration 6 months prior to their normal effective promotion date. Normal effective promotion date would be: 36 months TIS and 20 months TIG, or 28 months TIG, whichever occurs first. Airmen are identified during the processing month and SrA BTZ promotion selections are made during the months indicated in Table 1.1.

Table 1. SrA BTZ Promotion Selection Months

PROCESSING MONTHS	SELECTION MONTH	PROMOTION MONTHS
JAN/FEB	MAR	APR-JUN
APR/MAY	JUN	JUL-SEP
JUL/AUG	SEP	OCT-DEC
OCT/NOV	DEC	JAN-MAR

2. Responsibilities.

- 2.1. The Installation Commander is responsible for the Senior Airman Below-the-Zone Program and serves as the convening authority for the CBB. Furthermore, he or she establishes written administrative procedures and is the selection authority for small units serviced by their installation.
- 2.2. The Military Personnel Section (MPS) will distribute SrA BTZ quotas each quarter. Commanders of large units (seven or more eligibles) will receive their own quotas. Commanders of small units (six or less eligibles) will aggregate their eligibles to the CBB. The MPS will convene a CBB for the 412 TW/CC to consider all small unit eligibles competing for BTZ promotion.
- 2.3. The MPS will determine quotas and distribution is based on 15 percent of eligibles for promotion pertaining to Airmen who meet time-in-grade and time-in-service requirements. Approval authority for quota distribution is delegated to the MPS Chief.
- 2.4. All personnel will ensure adequate safeguards are implemented to prevent misuse of the personal information collected and maintained during the BTZ process. All board participants will use immense care in processing sensitive materials.
 - 2.4.1. Selection Folders shall be covered with a Privacy Act cover sheet and safeguarded at all times to prevent an unauthorized disclosure.
 - 2.4.2. Any personal information placed on shared drives and/or SharePoint for the purpose of collaboration during the BTZ process shall have appropriate access controls to ensure access is limited to authorized individuals that have a need to know to perform their assigned duties.

2.4.3. All information maintained on shared drives and/or SharePoint will be removed once collaboration is completed and maintained IAW the appropriate records disposition schedule.

3. Board Composition.

- 3.1. When a large unit board convenes, it must consist of at least three voting members in the grade of MSgt or higher, a non-voting recorder in the grade of SrA or higher, and a board president in the grade of CMSgt. If a CMSgt is not available to the unit, another Senior Noncommissioned Officer will be appointed by the unit's commander to be the board president.
- 3.2. The CBB will consist of four voting members in the grade of MSgt or higher (only 1 board member per group to include AFTC, wings, & tenant units), a non-voting recorder in the grade of SrA or higher, and the board president, who will be the 412 TW Command Chief Master Sergeant (CCC) or a CMSgt designated by the 412 TW/CCC. The 412 FSS/FSMPD will coordinate with AFTC, wings & tenant units to organize the CBB.

4. Method/Number of Nominations.

- 4.1. Large units will receive their own quotas and make selections at the unit level. Commanders of large units will convene a board and follow the same procedures as the CBB. Nominations must be in compliance with AFI 36-2502.
- 4.2. Small unit commanders will use the BTZ eligibility list and an appropriate evaluation process (e.g., a unit board, record review, recommendation from supervisors/first sergeants, etc.) to select eligibles that they will nominate to the CBB. Nominations must be in compliance with AFI 36-2502.

5. Board Procedures.

- 5.1. All BTZ nominees are required to physically appear before the CBB and large unit selection boards at the discretion of the board president. Individual exceptions will be granted for de-ployments or similar circumstances (i.e., emergency leave). Commanders, First Sergeants and supervisors will take all necessary steps to ensure the nominees are present to meet board (i.e., members on leave in the local area, shift workers). The CBB will normally convene on the 3rd Monday of the quarter (Mar, Jun, Sep, and Dec) in order for selection updates to be processed. In the event of exercises and alerts, boards will be rescheduled as required.
- 5.2. 412 FSS/FSMPD will prepare selection folders with Privacy Act coversheets and provide them to each board member 3 days prior to the CBB. The CBB voting members will score each nominee following the established procedures in paragraphs 6, 7 and 8 of this instruction. Selection folders will consist of documents described IAW paragraph 6 below.
- 5.3. Specific Large Unit Selection Board Procedures: Large Unit Selection Boards have nominees physically appear before the board at the discretion of the board president. Individual exceptions will be granted for deployments or similar circumstances (i.e., emergency leave). The request must be coordinated through the respective unit board president. If excused, nominees will receive "average" interview score based on all nominees meeting the board. Nominees that are not excused will receive zero points for interview score.

5.4. Specific CBB Procedures: Nominees are required to physically appear before the CBB. Individual exceptions will be granted for deployments or similar circumstances (i.e., emergency leave). The request must be coordinated through the respective Group Chief to be excused by the 412 TW/CCC. If excused, nominees will receive "average" interview score comprised of all present members. Nominees that are not excused will receive zero points for interview score.

5.5. Board President:

- 5.5.1. Serve as the facilitator of the board and will be responsible to oversee and guide the board members in selecting SrA BTZ candidates.
- 5.5.2. Oversee board operations. Be familiar with EAFBI 36-2502 and ensure strict adherence to this instruction.
- 5.5.3. Serve as final authority to select potential candidates and breaking any ties as needed.
- 5.5.4. Report to board 15 minutes prior to scheduled board time. Review and approve all board member questions.
- 5.5.5. Ensure each board member receives complete selection folder on each nominee. This folder should contain the following: BTZ RIP, Air Force Fitness Management System Physical Training score sheet, and EPR(s). If applicable, decoration citation(s) and AF Form 1206, *Nomination for Award*.
- 5.5.6. Upon board completion immediately ensure the return of all board member score sheets and selection folders to 412 FSS/FSMPD. Recorders will out brief board members on rules of board disclosure.

5.6. Board Member:

- 5.6.1. Be familiar and ensure strict adherence to this instruction
- 5.6.2. Review the score sheet. Note what each category is worth and how the points are broken down.
- 5.6.3. Judge how important each selection folder is based on your own intellect, experience and common sense. Don't bring in your own knowledge of the person, just the facts contained in the selection folder. Ensure AF Form 1206 (supplemental information) submission does not exceed 15-line maximum limit.
- 5.6.4. Grade each nomination package individually, awarding points based on three factors
 - 5.6.4.1. Leadership/Job Performance
 - 5.6.4.2. Significant Self-Improvement/Education
 - 5.6.4.3. Base/Community Involvement
- 5.6.5. Assign the proper points and ranking accordingly. It is important to take notes during the scoring process so you are prepared to openly discuss scoring considerations if the board president deems necessary.

- 5.7. Nominees will meet their respective board on the day specified by 412 FSS/FSMPD and report 15 minutes before their allotted time.
- 5.8. Uniform for nominees and board members is service dress.
- 5.9. The board will interview and score each nominee (EAFB Forms 6007 and 6008) according to the procedures outlined in paragraph 7, paragraph 8, paragraph 9, and attachment 5. (Note: Board president is a non-voting member except in the case of a dispute).
- 5.10. 412 FSS/FSMPD will prepare board minutes immediately following the CBB for 412 TW/CCC and 412 TW/CC approval. Upon approval of the minutes, 412 FSS/FSMPD will notify each nominee's unit commander of the CBB results.

6. Selection Folders.

- 6.1. Selection folders will include the BTZ RIP, AF Form 1206, EPRs, unit cover letter, current Air Force Fitness Management System Physical Training score sheet, and citations or orders for decorations. Selection folders are FOUO and must be safeguarded at all times to prevent any unauthorized disclosure of the sensitive personal information contained within.
- 6.2. Max score is 30 points. The AF Form 1206 will be accomplished for each nominee. The AF Form 1206 is limited to 15 lines. Headings should be included in the body of the AF Form 1206 (headings are excluded from the 15 line count). The following categories will be used (1) Leadership and Job Performance in Primary Duty (11 lines), (2) Significant Self Improvement (2 Lines), (3) Base and Community Involvement (2 lines). Each bullet under these categories will receive a max score of 2 points (in half-point increments) using the guidelines contained in attachment 5.
- 6.3. Definition of Leadership and Job Performance Category (11 lines): Describe significant leadership accomplishments and how well the member performed assigned primary and additional duties. Define the scope and level of responsibilities and the impact on the mission and unit. Include any new initiatives or techniques developed by the member that positively impacted the unit and/or mission. Include results of Air Force, MAJCOM, and Numbered Air Force-level inspections and/or evaluations. Include awards received such as Quarterly and Annual awards.
- 6.4. Definition of Self-Improvement Category (2 lines): You may comment on how the member developed or improved skills related to primary duties; e.g., formal training, certifications, education related to primary duties, and so forth. Include any off-duty education not directly related to primary duties; e.g., class, course, degree enrollment and/or completion or grade point average. Cite any other relevant training or activity that significantly enhanced the member's value as a military citizen.
- 6.5. Definition of Base or Community Involvement Category (2 lines): Define the scope and impact of the member's professional leadership, image and involvement in both the military and civilian community. Include leadership, membership or participation in unit advisory councils, professional military organizations, associations and events; e.g., President of Dorm Council, enlisted dining in/out committees, Base Honor Guard, Sunday school teacher and so forth.

7. Personal Interview Board.

7.1. Max score is 10 Points. The primary purpose of the interview board is the professional development of assigned Airmen and to ensure appearance is commensurate with written performance. There are three areas that are evaluated during the interview: (1) Dress and Appearance (3 points), (2) Military Bearing (3 points) and (3) Communication Skills (4 points). Each board member will prepare one question for the nominee and will score the member based on the nominee's answer to their question. The questions will be from the following 4 categories (1) Current Events, (2) Standards of Conduct, (3) Dress and Appearance, and (4) Customs and Courtesies. Also, the member may be asked to recite the Airman's Creed. All opinionated questions will be based on the AFPAM 36-2241, *Professional Development Guide*, and current media such as local and base newspaper, Air Force Times, Airman Magazine, etc.

8. Scoring Scale/Selection Phase.

- 8.1. Selection will be based on a combination of the personal interview & selection folder scores. The personal interview is 25 percent of overall weighted value and is worth 10 points. The selection folder is worth 75 percent; Leadership and Job Performance is the most important category and is worth 22 points, Self-Improvement and Base and Community Involvement are each worth 4 points.
 - 8.1.1. Decorations: Max score equal to value of decorations awarded. Performance that results in an Airman receiving a decoration should be rewarded. Refer to AFI 36-2502, page 32 for decoration point values. Point(s) for a decoration are added separately to the final score worksheet.
 - 8.1.2. The total score will be given to the board president and/or recorder when all records have been scored. The board president and/or recorder computes the total score of each eligible by adding the ranking order of all the voting members (i.e., someone ranked by the board as #1, #2, #3, #1 will receive a total score of 5). After computing the total scores they will determine an order-of-merit by ranking the lowest score first and the highest score last on EDWARDSAFB Form 6009, *Below the Zone (BTZ) Board Recorder's Ballot*. In the event of two or more members have the same overall score; the board president will break the tie. Additionally, all eligibles will be completely ranked in the order of merit in case a selectee becomes disqualified prior to their promotion effective date.
 - 8.1.3. Scoring Ties/Scores Disparity/Scrambled Scores: At times the board president will be required to resolve scoring ties, scoring disparity and scrambled scores. Under these circumstances the board president will lead a line-by-line open discussion until the board members reconcile the dispute. The Board President will follow the dispute process (Attachment 5).

9. Reporting Board Results.

9.1. Large unit nominees are arranged in an order of merit by total score and the quota is applied. Commanders will report selections to the MPS by underlining the name(s) on the BTZ eligibility list, providing board minutes with attachments (Attachment 3, Large Unit Minutes Memorandum) and returning them to 412 FSS/FSMPD NLT the day the CBB board is convened. The MPS will forward a copy of the minutes to the 412 TW/CCC for review.

Commanders are not required to select a nominee to fill the unit's quota if he/she deems that the quality is not there. The squadron commander of large units will announce their selectees only after 412 TW/CC has approved CBB selections.

- 9.2. For the CBB, the board president sends a written report (Attachment 4, CBB Minutes Memorandum) to the convening authority with an order of merit list of all Airmen considered. The 412 TW/CC may approve the board's merit list (in whole or in part) or disapprove the promotion of an Airman whose record does not justify BTZ promotion. The 412 TW/CC may elect not to use the full quota.
 - 9.2.1. Once CBB results have been approved and signed, 412 FSS/FSMPD will provide a copy of the select list to group commanders and squadron commanders via email.
- 9.3. The MPS will project promotions immediately upon receipt of confirmation of selections from the large unit commanders and the 412 TW/CC for the CBB. This must be accomplished prior to the end of the board month.
- 9.4. Board proceedings, findings, and related records are FOUO and destroyed 1 year after approval (AFRIMS Table 36-19, Rule 04.00); applies only to MPS not units.

10. Alternate Selection.

10.1. Alternates may be selected in the event a selectee is removed or not recommended for promotion before the promotion effective date. The MPS will review board minutes to determine who the first alternate is and notify the commander of that individual. If the commander recommends the alternate for promotion, he/she forwards a letter to the MPS for the concurrence of 412 TW/CC.

11. Supplemental Consideration.

11.1. If an eligible Airman was not considered, and the error is discovered before the promotions are announced, large unit commanders consider the Airman and adjust selections accordingly. The CBB will be reconvened to consider small unit eligibles and adjust selections accordingly. If the error is found after the promotions are announced, the MPS will forward a request for supplemental consideration, by message, to HQ AFPC/DPPPWM. For non-consideration reasons, please refer to AFI 36-2502, para 2.5.2.

MICHAEL T. BREWER, Brigadier General, USAF Commander

GLOSSARY OF REFERENCES & SUPPORTING INFORMATION

References

AFI 31-401, AF Information Protection Program

AFI 33-332, AF Privacy and Civil Liberties Program

AFPD 36-25, Military Promotion and Demotion

AFI 36-2502, Airman Promotion Program

AFI 36-2903, Dress and Personal Appearance of Air Force Personnel

AFMAN 33-363, Management of Records

DODR 5400.7_AFMAN 33-302, DoD/AF Freedom of Information Act Program

Prescribed Forms

EDWARDSAFB Form 6007, Below the Zone (BTZ) Selection Folder Final Score Form

EDWARDSAFB Form 6008, Below the Zone (BTZ) Interview

EDWARDSAFB Form 6009, Below the Zone (BTZ) Board Recorders Ballot

Adopted Forms

AF Form 1206, Nomination for Award

Abbreviations and Acronyms

A1C—Airman First Class

BTZ—Below the Zone

CBB—Central Base Board

CCC—Command Chief Master Sergeant

CDC—Career Development Courses

EPR—Enlisted Performance Report

FSS—Force Support Squadron

MPS—Military Personnel Section

SrA—Senior Airman

UNIT COVER LETTER SAMPLE

Figure A2.1. Unit Cover Letter Sample



UNIT COVER LETTER, Sample

< Date >

MEMORANDUM FOR 412 FSS/FSMPD

FROM: 412 FSS/CL

SUBJECT: Senior Airman Below-the-Zone Nomination

- 1. Airman Doe, John D., is nominated to compete for Senior Airman Below-the-Zone at the Team Edwards Central Base Board. I have reviewed the attached AF Form 1206, Air Force Fitness Management Report, BTZ RIP, Evaluation Performance Reports, Commander's Personnel Information File, and citations or orders for decorations (as required), and find Airman Doe worthy of this nomination.
- 2. If you have any questions pertaining to this nomination, please contact me at DSN XXX-XXXX.

Commander's Signature Block

- 3 Attachments:
- 1. AF Form 1206 A1C Doe
- 2. Air Force Fitness Management Report -A1C Doe
- 3. Citations or orders for decorations -A1C Doe

For Official Use Only

This document contains information exempt from mandatory disclosure under the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA), Title 5 U.S.C. 552(b) (2) High and (b) (6) apply.

LARGE UNIT MINUTES MEMORANDUM SAMPLE

Figure A3.1. Large Unit Minutes Memorandum Sample

LARGE UNIT MINUTES MEMORANDUM, Sample		
< Deta >		
MEMORANDUM FOR < UNIT CC >		
FROM: <board president=""></board>		
SUBJECT: Senior Airman (SrA) Below-the-Zone (BTZ) Promotion Board		
1. The SrA BTZ Board convened at hours on, and adjourned at hours. The board was composed of: CMSgt, President MSgt, Member MSgt, Member MSgt, Member TSgt, Member TSgt, Board Recorder (non-voting member) 2. The board considered Airmen First Class for BTZ. The cutoff score was; their score, date eligible, and standing in order of merit is indicated below: #1 A1C First/Last Name, Score, Date Eligible, Standing #2 A1C First/Last Name, Score, Date Eligible, Standing 3. Request your approval of the board proceedings.		
Board President's Signature Block		
Attachment: 1. Board Member Ballots 2. Recorder's Roster		
lst Ind,LtrSrA BTZ Promotion Board		
UNIT/CC		
TO: 412 FSS/FSMPD		
Approved.		
Commander's Signature Block		
For Official Use Only This document contains information exempt from mandatory disclosure under the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA), Title 5 U.S.C. 552(b)(2) High and (b)(6) apply. (When completed)		

CENTRAL BASE BOARD MINUTES MEMORANDUM SAMPLE

Figure A4.1. Central Base Board Minutes Memorandum Sample

CENTRAL BASE BOARD MINUTES MEMORANDUM, Sample
< Date >
ATTACA ANTANA (TOD ANATHUM)
MEMORANDUM FOR 412 TW/CC
FROM: 412 TW/CCC
SUBJECT: Senior Airman (SrA) Below-the-Zone (BTZ) Promotion Board
1. The SrA BTZ Board convened at hours on, and adjourned at hours. The board was composed of: CMSgt, President MSgt, Member MSgt, Member MSgt, Member TSgt, Board Recorder (non-voting member)
The board considered Airmen First Class for BTZ. The cutoff score was; their score, date eligible, and standing in order of merit is indicated below: #1 A1C First/Last Name, Score, Date Eligible, Standing #2 A1C First/Last Name, Score, Date Eligible, Standing
3. Request your approval of the board proceedings.
Board President's Signature Block
Attachment: 1. Board MemberBallots 2. Recorder's Roster
1st Ind, 412 TW/CCC Ltr,, SrA BTZ Promotion Board
412 TW/CC
TO: 412 FSS/FSMPD
Approved.
First/Last Name Brigadier General, USAF Commander, 412th Test Wing
For Official Use Only This document contains information exempt from mandatory disclosure under the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA), Title 5 U.S.C. 552(b)(2) High and (b)(6) apply. (When completed)

SCORING GUIDELINES

Figure A5.1. Scoring Guidelines

SCORING PROCEDURES

Score every line from "0" to "2" points

✓ Fluff 0 Points vague, unclear, poorly written,

✓ Membership-level ½ Point help, assist, participate, support; short class; unit award

✓ Supervisory-level 1 Point supervise, lead, take charge, etc.; higher-level impact;

long courses; CCAF Degree, group awards; war impact

✓ Management-level 1½ Points direct, plan, organize with greater scope; Bachelors

Degree, Distinguished Graduate; Wing awards;

significant war impact

✓ Leadership-level 2 Points broad scope; vast personnel; higher education; HQ/AF

awards; extraordinary war impact

Typical Bullet Formats:

Action; Impact--Result (AIR)

• Action: Individual performance

• Impact: How the task affected the next level

• Result: Tie results to the big picture

•

Tactical; Operational--Strategic (TOS)

• Tactical: Individual performance

• Operational: Impact to Base, next level

• Strategic: Results to AOR, HHQ, etc.

Bullet must have at least two of three components and one component must include "Individual performance." Without "Individual performance" accomplishment is not attributed to individual. See scoring examples below.

Scoring Examples:

- Attitude & dedication helped garner the AF-level Unit Award
- Zero points! Person was "there"...don't know what they did!
- SrA acting as pro super; supv 223 flightline pers--3.3K CAP sorties
- Zero points; Flightline Pro Super is MSgt-min rqmt for E/R orders
- Leader! Washed cars for Booster Club--raised \$200 for unit
- 1/2 point; More like a "member" instead of "leader"
- Changed tire; aircraft serviceable--MC rate met standard
- 1/2 point; Small impact: duties in line with rank of Airmen
- Led fundraiser; org'd people/logistics--raised \$200 for unit party
- 1 point; "Management-type" effort but small in scope
- R2d tire on REDBALL; on time sortie--12/12 aircraft for exercise
- 1 point; Medium impact: duties in line with rank but supporting larger picture
- Improved trng prgm; adopted for 500 pers unit--zero disc by IG
- 1 ½ or 2 points; significant contribution...management or leadership level
- R2d tire on REDBALL; ensured on time CAS sortie--GBUs struck insurgents
- 1 ½ or 2 points; Large impact: duties in line with Airmen rank but tied to AOR mission
- SrA acted as Sqd Ldr; repelled al-Qaida--prevented C-130 damage
- 2 points; Duties above rank with magnitude of impact & result

DISPUTE PROCESS

Figure A6.1. Dispute Process

At times the board president will be required to resolve scoring ties, scoring disparity and scrambled scores. Both of these examples create a dispute situation. Under these circumstances the board president will lead a line-by-line open discussion until the board members reconcile the dispute. When necessary, the Board President will implement the dispute process below.

Example of a SCORING TIE:

```
#1 package: 1st, 1st, 2nd, 2nd = 6 (tie)

#2 package: 2nd, 2nd, 1st, 1st = 6 (tie)

#3 package: 3rd, 3rd, 3rd, 3rd = 12 (third)

#4 package: 4th, 4th, 4th, 4th = 16 (fourth)
```

A scoring tie occurs when one package, for example, receives (#1, #1, #2, #2) for a total of "6" votes and a second package receives (#2, #2, #1, #1) for a total of "6" votes. The board president must implement dispute process to break tie.

Example of a SCORING DISPARITY:

```
#1 package: 1st, 1st, 2th, 4d = 8
#2 package: 2d, 2d, 1d, 2th = 7
#3 package: 3d, 3th, 3d, 3st = 10
#4 package: 4th, 4d, 4st, 1d = 10
```

A scoring disparity occurs if the majority of the board is within an acceptable range (#1, #2, #1) and one voting member ranks and individual as their (#4). The board president must implement dispute process to determine the cause of inconsistency.

Example of a SCRAMBLED SCORING:

```
#1 package: 1st, 1st, 4th, 3d = 9
#2 package: 2d, 2d, 3d, 4th = 11
#3 package: 3d, 4th, 2d, 1st = 10
#4 package: 4th, 3d, 1st, 2d = 10
```

Scrambled scoring occurs when multiple packages receive a wide range of votes and there is no consistency. The board president must implement dispute process to determine the cause of inconsistency.

DISPUTE PROCESS

Board president leads a line-by-line discussion of each package to resolve scoring ties, scoring disparity and scrambled scores

Each line must be reconciled to within 1/2 point.

If board members cannot reconcile within 1/2 point the board president shall reveal the score for that line and all board members change their score for that line to the board president's score.

After every line on the disputed packages has been reconciled board members will re-tally packages to see if process resulted in change of rankings, thereby breaking the tie.

If line-by-line review did not break the tie the board president will reveal his rank order thereby breaking the tie.